

# UTQAP Cyclical Review: Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan

---

## 1. Review Summary

<b>Programs Reviewed:</b>	International Development Studies, H.B.A.: Specialist, Specialist Co-op, Major  International Development Studies, H.B.Sc.: Specialist, Specialist Co-op  International Development Studies Minor (Arts)
<b>Unit Reviewed:</b>	Centre for Critical Development Studies
<b>Commissioning Officer:</b>	Vice-Principal, Academic and Dean, University of Toronto Scarborough
<b>Reviewers (Name, Affiliation):</b>	Professor John Cameron, Department of International Development Studies, Dalhousie University  Professor Rebecca Tiessen, School of International Development and Global Studies, University of Ottawa  Professor Karl Zimmerer, Department of Geography, Pennsylvania State University
<b>Date of Review Visit:</b>	March 3-4 & 10-11, 2021
<b>Date Reported to AP&amp;P:</b>	October 26, 2021

## Previous UTQAP Review

**Date:** December 12–13, 2013

### Summary of Findings and Recommendations

#### Significant Program Strengths

- High quality of the programs
- Outstanding calibre of students
- Innovative and unique Co-operative programs
- Faculty dedication to ensuring student success
- Deep engagement of program stakeholders
- Vibrant sense of community

#### Opportunities for Program Enhancement

- Ensuring first-year students understand relevance of core first-year courses to development issues
- Identifying ways to ensure the needs of students in the Major program are met
- Strengthening the development economics and research methodology content of the curriculum
- Maximizing student learning during international field placements
- Exploring non-traditional models of language learning for students
- Acquiring the necessary resources to transition the unit from an Extra-Departmental Unit: B to an Extra-Departmental Unit: A, which will create greater program stability and enable it to manage faculty resources better
- Developing a Master's program

## Current Review: Documentation and Consultation

---

### Documentation Provided to Reviewers

1. About the University and UTSC: UTSC Strategic Plan, 2020-25; UTSC Academic Plan (2015-20); UTSC Admissions Viewbook (2020-21); Campus Virtual Tour.
2. About the Review: Terms of Reference; Review Report Template; Remote Site Visit Schedule.
3. About the Department: Previous External Review Report (2014); Unit Academic Plan, April 2015; Unit Self Study, January 2021.
4. About Programs and Courses: Description of all programs (2020-21 Academic Calendar); and description of all courses (2020-21 Academic Calendar); Self-Study Data.
5. Course Syllabi (all courses).
6. Faculty CVs (all faculty).

## Consultation Process

The reviewers met with the following: the decanal group, including the Vice-Principal Academic and Dean, Vice-Dean Recruitment, Enrolment and Student Success, Vice-Dean Teaching, Learning and Undergraduate Programs, Vice-Dean Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies, Interim Vice-Dean Faculty Affairs, Equity and Success, Acting Associate Dean Undergraduate Programs and Curriculum, Director, Office of the VP Dean, and Academic Programs Officer; the Vice-Principal Research; the Director of the Centre for Critical Development Studies; CCDS faculty – tenure- and teaching-stream (all ranks); Staff, IDS Co-op; UTSC Chief Librarian and library staff; departmental administrative staff; undergraduate students; and graduate students.

## Current Review: Findings and Recommendations

---

### 1. Undergraduate Programs

*Unless otherwise noted, all bulleted comments apply to all programs reviewed.*

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Overall quality
  - ▶ International Co-op program a flagship for CCDS and UTSC, with a long history and strong reputation for outstanding learning experiences
  - ▶ CCDS programs attract strong students to undergraduate programs and graduate collaborative specialization
- Objectives
  - ▶ Clear requirements and learning outcomes for all CCDS programs
  - ▶ Well-designed programs offer students a range of opportunities to achieve the learning outcomes and degree expectations
  - ▶ Course offerings ensure Co-op students develop a solid foundation prior to their Co-op experience, and a deep and analytical reflective experience afterward
- Admissions requirements
  - ▶ Rigorous admission process is inclusive of the diversity of the applicant pool
- Curriculum and program delivery
  - ▶ Programs are rigorous and well-designed, offering a wide-ranging, interdisciplinary education in International Development Studies (IDS)
  - ▶ “Extraordinary strength and expertise” in political science, political economy, and food security; recent hires will enable expansion of expertise into areas of African studies, colonialism and diaspora studies
  - ▶ Positive efforts since the previous review to offer more courses with a focus on languages and language studies
  - ▶ CCDS is a leader, within UTSC and among Canadian IDS programs, in providing exceptional learning opportunities for students; Centre has made immense strides to increase local and domestic experiential learning opportunities

- ▶ Knowledge Equity Hub has been an excellent addition to experiential learning offerings, with widespread interest and commitment to expansion from students, staff and faculty
- ▶ Co-op program offers a strong opportunity for undergraduate students to conduct original field research and to write an honours thesis
- Innovation
  - ▶ CCDS demonstrates a strong level of reflection and innovation to adapt the program to student needs and to the changing state of the world
  - ▶ Interdisciplinarity in CCDS programs and research is unique and highly valued
  - ▶ Interdisciplinary emphasis in environmental science is a unique area of specialization, well suited to synergies with other UTSC programs
  - ▶ Collaborative Online International Learning (COIL) classroom provides rich opportunities for intercultural learning
  - ▶ Knowledge Equity Hub and Community Knowledge Learning Hub are “highly innovative initiatives” which support experiential learning opportunities, and make them accessible to a more diverse range of students
- Assessment of learning
  - ▶ CCDS programs employ rigorous and diverse methods to assess student learning and to achievement of identified learning outcomes
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
  - ▶ CCDS offers a very strong learning experience with innovative approaches to learning inside and outside the classroom.
  - ▶ Students report receiving strong advising and mentoring support from staff and faculty, particularly in the Co-op program
  - ▶ Strong engagement in outreach and promotion to prospective students
  - ▶ “Overall, students appear to be very pleased with their experience”
- Quality indicators – undergraduate students
  - ▶ Highly competitive admissions process for the International Co-op program is clear evidence of the strength of students
  - ▶ No evidence of any issues with student retention or time to completion
- Quality indicators – alumni
  - ▶ Existing data indicates that CCDS graduates find rewarding, well-paying jobs in a wide range of professional fields
- Student funding
  - ▶ CCDS has made exceptional efforts to reduce financial barriers to participation in the international Co-op program

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Curriculum and program delivery
  - ▶ Additional expertise is needed to support honours thesis students focussing on topics related to South and Southeast Asia
  - ▶ Reports from students regarding redundancy in material covered in some courses

- ▶ Students commented on difficulty transitioning from CCDS coursework to their Co-op placements, noting a “disconnect” between course content and their experiences in the field
- Accessibility and diversity
  - ▶ Students noted the need for additional supports and more inclusive approaches to the pre-departure preparation and debriefing processes, both for the students and the Co-op partner organizations hosting them
  - ▶ Students highlighted that, during co-op placements, treatment and expectations of students who identify as part of BIPOC communities can be different than for white students
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
  - ▶ Flagship Co-op program serves a small minority of CCDS students; reviewers caution that non-Co-op students may feel marginalized as “second class citizens” and note reports of non-Co-op students feeling disconnected from the unit
  - ▶ Reports from some students of sexual harassment, discrimination, and unsafe living arrangements during their Co-op placements; students felt strongly that they did not receive adequate support to navigate these issues
  - ▶ Student concerns regarding lack of clarity about additional costs they may incur during Co-op placements that are not covered by program fees
  - ▶ Students reported receiving little feedback on bimonthly reports submitted while on Co-op placements
  - ▶ Students view Co-op placement process as insufficiently transparent, expressing frustration about being denied placements with organizations that they had researched and proposed
  - ▶ International students indicated that they were not aware, prior to entering the program, that visa/legal status might restrict their options for Co-op placements relative to Canadian students
- Student funding
  - ▶ Cost of International Co-op program remains a barrier for some students; many students experience financial difficulty during their Co-op placements

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Admissions requirements
  - ▶ Continue to regularly review and revise Co-op admissions process to ensure fairness and inclusivity
- Curriculum and program delivery
  - ▶ Pursue opportunities to expand and showcase the breadth of experiential learning opportunities for CCDS students, and ensure that experiential learning opportunities are available to all students
    - Continue exploring possibilities for partnerships and experiential learning opportunities with northern Canadian and Indigenous communities
    - Consider supporting internship opportunities, particularly for students with interests in environmental conservation, biology, and agroecology

- ▶ Strengthen the interdisciplinary scope of CCDS programs
- ▶ Create additional opportunities, including dedicated course offerings, for students to engage in critical reflection on the ethics of working with marginalized groups and disadvantaged individuals
- ▶ Explore additional linkages with language studies, and continue creating opportunities for students to develop linguistic skills
- ▶ Review content of CCDS and cross-listed courses to reduce duplication in material covered
- ▶ Review the Co-op program with the goal of better aligning the critical analytical components of the program with student experiences in Co-op placements
- ▶ Conduct a survey of current and former Co-op partner organizations to evaluate impact of the Co-op program, and to gain insights for future program development
- ▶ Enhance opportunities for practical learning in courses, including monitoring and evaluation in project management
- ▶ Support and expand non-Co-op programs; provide more opportunities for non-Co-op students to fully engage in the field of development studies
- ▶ Consider expanding the undergraduate thesis option to include non-Co-op students
- Innovation
  - ▶ Provide financial support to sustain and expand Knowledge Equity Hub and Community Knowledge Learning Hub, to support community-based global learning opportunities accessible to all students
  - ▶ Consider post-pandemic continuation of virtual volunteering opportunities for students who cannot or prefer not to travel abroad
  - ▶ Continue supporting highly innovative and promising 'Activist in Residence' and 'Practitioner in Residence' programs
- Accessibility and diversity
  - ▶ Ensure that curriculum design, especially the preparation for international Co-op placements, reflects the lived realities of the large numbers of racialized students in the program
  - ▶ Work with Co-op partner organizations to guarantee safety, fair treatment, and equality of opportunity for all students
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
  - ▶ Review and consider allocation of time and resources across programs to ensure that all students feel they are valued and have appropriate access to learning opportunities
  - ▶ Carefully consider the concerns of non-Co-op students, who feel that they receive less attention from faculty and staff than Co-op students
  - ▶ Consider providing additional financial resources for students to cover unforeseen costs incurred while on Co-op placements
  - ▶ Ensure that CCDS has the capacity to respond appropriately to student concerns expressed in bimonthly reports submitted during Co-op placements
  - ▶ Provide additional clarity regarding the decision-making processes behind allocation of Co-op placements

- ▶ Enhance mentorship opportunities between current and previous Co-op students, particularly those with experience in the same partner organizations
- ▶ Explore opportunities to strengthen students' voice in shaping the future of the Knowledge Equity Hub
- Quality indicators – alumni
  - ▶ Continue researching the career paths of CCDS graduates, and engaging graduates in providing feedback to contribute to program development
- Student funding
  - ▶ Clear need for additional external funding to provide appropriate assistance and enhance accessibility of the International Co-op program

## 2. Graduate Program (n/a)

## 3. Faculty/Research

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Research
  - ▶ Faculty members engage in high level research and publish in some of the highest-ranking journals
  - ▶ Scope, quality and relevance of faculty research activities are appropriate and on par with national and international comparators
- Faculty
  - ▶ CCDS faculty members are international leaders in community-engaged learning and public access to academic research
  - ▶ Diverse faculty complement with expertise in a range of disciplinary and interdisciplinary fields, and geographic areas
  - ▶ Excellent recent faculty hires will help expand course offerings and areas of research expertise
  - ▶ Faculty are highly committed to mentoring graduate students, both within the CCDS collaborative specialization and in Master's and PhD programs in other units

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Research
  - ▶ Encourage faculty to pursue additional internal and external research funding opportunities
  - ▶ Successful, specialized approaches in interdisciplinary environmental science may serve as a resource to contribute to expanding faculty interest, experience, and expertise in obtaining research funding
- Faculty
  - ▶ Careful strategic decisions will be needed in CCDS faculty complement planning and the strengthening of collaborative relationships with other departments

- ▶ Work closely with Chairs of other units to ensure that workload expectations for junior faculty members are fair and clearly communicated
- ▶ Consider thematic/regional gaps as well as increasing BIPOC representation in future complement planning
- ▶ Reviewers caution against “the trap of reinforcing disciplinary siloes” in faculty complement planning
- ▶ Support interdisciplinarity by expanding affiliations with non-CCDS faculty

## 4. Administration

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Relationships
  - ▶ Very strong morale and dedication among faculty and staff, despite heavy workloads
  - ▶ Commendable, effective efforts in cultivating and fostering relationships with other units
  - ▶ Deep engagement with community-based/non-governmental organizations in Toronto, Canada and the rest of the world through Co-op and experiential learning programs
- Organizational and financial structure
  - ▶ Complex organizational and financial structure requires strong leadership to manage effectively
  - ▶ Unit has been able to thrive despite organizational challenges, primarily due to strong interdisciplinary commitments of faculty and staff
  - ▶ Impressive capacity to generate external funding for experiential learning programs and other initiatives
  - ▶ CCDS appears to make good use of its existing facilities
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
  - ▶ CCDS is at a critical and exciting juncture; transition to department status is expected to create new opportunities for growth and expansion
  - ▶ Solid, effective alignment with UTSC’s Strategic Plan and the University’s overall mission; CCDS is well-positioned to make important contributions towards the achievements of specific major components of the UTSC plan
- International comparators
  - ▶ CCDS compares favourably with other IDS programs in Canada and globally in terms of the quality of teaching, research outputs and community engagement.
  - ▶ Co-op program is particularly unique, in Canada/North America and globally.

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Organizational and financial structure
  - ▶ Heavy staff workloads, particularly related to student advising and management of Co-op and experiential learning programs



- ▶ Staff concerns that plans to spread their workspaces throughout the building in which CCDS and other Social Science departments are based will undermine productivity and threaten their morale
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
  - ▶ Reviewers note lack of clarity and consensus on future directions for CCDS

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Relationships
  - ▶ Build on existing interdisciplinary strengths through increased connection and collaboration with other units
- Organizational and financial structure
  - ▶ Consider options for providing additional administrative support, particularly to Co-op and experiential learning programs
  - ▶ Clarify areas of responsibility for key leadership roles, and consider appointment of two associate chairs: one for undergraduate work and one for graduate work and research support
  - ▶ Space planning for staff should carefully consider issues related to in-person work, communication and coordination among staff, as well as productivity and morale
  - ▶ Consider creation of a faculty advisory committee to expand and enhance the participation of faculty members in departmental governance
  - ▶ Address the need for more student common space
  - ▶ CCDS will need support from the Development and Alumni Relations Office and other units responsible for external fundraising to continue to support and expand innovative programs and initiatives
  - ▶ Consider succession planning for administrative leadership roles
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
  - ▶ Undertake a strategic planning process to consider the unit's future directions, priorities for future hiring, faculty complement planning, and opportunities for stronger linkages with other units
  - ▶ Strategic plan should consider gaps in expertise needed to expand the scope and content of program curricula and graduate supervision
  - ▶ Strong encouragement to invest in expansion of CCDS graduate program offerings, including a standalone MA program, strengthening of Masters-level collaborative specialization, and adding PhD-level collaborative specialization
  - ▶ Expand the range of courses available to students in the collaborative specialization, and expand professional networking opportunities for graduate students
  - ▶ Additional resources and strong leadership needed to expand enrolment in non-Co-op programs, and to serve the needs of both Co-op and non-Co-op students
- International comparators
  - ▶ Further improvement against international and national comparators will require strong leadership, careful strategic planning/envisioning, and increased financial resources to expand the faculty complement

## 2. Administrative Response & Implementation Plan

10



Office of the Vice-Principal Academic & Dean

September 30, 2021

Professor Susan McCahan  
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
Office of the Vice-President and Provost  
University of Toronto

### **Dean's Administrative Response: External Review of the Centre for Critical Development Studies**

Dear Susan,

Thank you for your letter of July 21, 2021 requesting my administrative response to the external review of the Centre for Critical Development Studies (CCDS). We want to thank the review team – Professor John Cameron, Department of International Development Studies, Dalhousie University; Professor Rebecca Tiessen, School of International Development and Global Studies, University of Ottawa; and Professor Karl Zimmerer, Department of Geography, Pennsylvania State University– for their consultation with us during the remote site-visit, held on March 3<sup>rd</sup>, 4<sup>th</sup>, 10, and 11<sup>th</sup>, 2021, and for their report, which was finalized on April 27, 2021. It will be helpful, here, to note that CCDS was converted to the Department of Global Development Studies (GDS) effective July 1, 2021. Throughout this letter, we have used the acronym GDS when referring to the current and future actions of the department.

I appreciate the seriousness with which the reviewers approached the external review process, as well the thoughtful consideration given to CCDS and its undergraduate programs in the review Report. I am very pleased by the overall positive review of the department. In particular, the reviewers noted the unit's strong alignment with the UTSC Strategic Plan (Inspiring Inclusive Excellence); the rigorous and well-designed undergraduate International Development Studies program, which they describe as "on par with the strongest IDS programs in Canada"; the "strong level of reflection and innovation to adapt the program to the changing state of the world and to student needs"; and the very high quality of students at both the undergraduate and graduate levels.

The external review report was sent to the Director of the CCDS, Professor Paul Kingston, on May 5, 2021, with a request to share it widely among the faculty, staff and students. On September 9, 2021, the decanal group, including myself, the Vice-Dean Teaching, Learning and Undergraduate Programs (VDTLUP), Vice-Dean Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (VDGPS), Vice-Dean, Recruitment, Enrolment and Student Success (VDRESS), Vice-Dean Faculty Affairs, Equity, and Success (VDFAES), Interim Associate Dean Undergraduate Programs and Curriculum (ADUPC), Associate Dean Experiential and Global Learning, and the Academic Programs Officer, met with the Chair, and one of Associate Chairs, of GDS to discuss the external review report and administrative response; I am pleased with the depth of the discussion that took place.

My administrative response to the points raised in your letter is given below. This response has been developed in close consultation with the Chair of GDS, and reflects the key elements of the unit response letter, dated September 27, 2021. It also includes responses to points raised in the Request for Administrative Response that are outside departmental control.

Let me address the specific points raised in your letter:

- *The reviewers recommended that CCDS undertake a comprehensive strategic planning and visioning process to clarify future directions as the unit changes in status from an EDU:B to an academic department, including:*
  - *Consideration of areas for academic specialization and course offerings;*
  - *Priorities for future faculty hiring and complement planning; and*
  - *Administration and management of the department, including succession planning, future hiring priorities, and space planning.*

In her Response letter, the Chair agrees with the reviewers that GDS will benefit from undertaking a comprehensive strategic planning and visioning process. Starting in 2021-22, and continuing over the next 2 years, GDS will hold a series of department and committee meetings focused on establishing their future direction and priorities, and a set of core values for pedagogical practices and research priorities, as well as departmental daily operations and governance practices. These discussions will help to shape preliminary and ongoing discussion around academic specialization and course offerings. The department anticipates these discussions will also result in improved communication of their collective pedagogical philosophies around development thought and practice. GDS values the discomfort that comes with having to reconcile the critical thinking that students learn in courses with the realities of mainstream development while on placement or in volunteer/internship opportunities. Bearing this tension in mind, the department advocates establishing a “Practitioner-in-Residence”; my office is supportive of “activist-in-residence” initiatives. The Dean’s Office will work with GDS during this process to provide guidance and support, as well as assistance to leverage any available resources.

With regard to the recommendation that the department consider areas for academic specialization and course offerings, GDS will be undertaking a number of actions, including:

- i. As of Fall 2021, they have established two curriculum committees – one focused on International Development Studies (IDS) and the other focused on African Studies (AFS). For IDS programs, key considerations will be expanding the diversity of their course offerings, and a possible program name change to Global Development Studies. For AFS programs, the focus will be on fully integrating both AFS programs and faculty into GDS.
- ii. In 2023-24, the department will meet for a day long retreat to re-orient course offerings along the goals and values defined during the strategic planning and visioning process.
- iii. Finally, with regard to expanding language offerings at UTSC, my office recognizes the importance of considering this as resources allow. We will encourage the GDS to work in collaboration with the Department of Language Studies to ensure that available language offerings are optimized to meet campus-wide needs. We are also prioritizing the further development of language study options that connect directly to and benefit our local community.

With regard to the recommendation that the department consider priorities for future faculty hiring and complement planning, the Chair highlights the recent hire of two new tenure-stream faculty at the Associate Professor rank: Caroline Hossein, whose research focuses on Cooperative Banking for Racialized Women, and Zubairu Wai, whose research focuses on Epistemologies of African Development have joined the department, effective August 1, 2021. The Chair notes a need for further faculty hiring to support African Studies, as well as the desirability of a future hire focused on South/South East Asian Studies.

To support the department in their complement planning, in 2019-20, UTSC established the Faculty Complement Committee (FCC) to provide recommendations to me regarding the distribution of teaching-stream and tenure-stream faculty positions sought by academic units in the yearly recruitment cycle, within the context of strategic multi-year departmental and campus faculty complements. The FCC provides a consultative, inclusive and transparent process that involves all academic units in determining the complement submission at UTSC. GDS will be encouraged to bring their plans and priorities forward each year through the FCC. My office will also work with GDS to ensure it has the resources it needs to support the further development of the African Studies Program, which it is now administering.

With regard to the recommendation that the department consider its administration and management, including succession planning, future hiring priorities, and space planning: first, GDS notes that a number of actions have already taken place, following the recent departmentalization. GDS is now headed by a Chair, who is supported by two Associate Chairs – one responsible for chairing the department’s Curriculum Committee and managing related matters, and the other for managing the allocation of TAs and the hiring of stipend instructors. The Chair manages the annual teaching roster, acts as liaison with the departmental student association, and takes the lead on department operations and events. The Chair and Associate Chairs meet regularly as an Executive Committee, and the Associate Chair roles will rotate among the faculty every 2 years – a structure that is designed to facilitate succession planning. Second, the department has approval for a new administrative staff role that will focus on student advising (this role will be shared with the Departments of Political Science and Human Geography). Finally, regarding space, the Vice-Dean Faculty Affairs, Equity and Success is working closely with all UTSC Chairs and their Business Managers on space planning. The Chair of GDS notes that, as a group, academic leadership is paying attention to the expressed needs and desires of staff for both hybrid work arrangements and optimal office design for shared spaces. There is already evidence that this action has eased staff concerns and improved morale around the location and placement of administrative offices.

- *The reviewers made a number of recommendations regarding the expansion, enhancement, and accessibility of co-op and broader experiential learning opportunities for all CCDS students.*

As the Chair describes in her Response letter, expanding opportunities for Co-op and broader experiential learning opportunities for all GDS students is a departmental priority. In 2021-22, GDS will host a department wide Open House for all students. Other initiatives include:

- Further development of the Knowledge Equity lab coupled design of the GDS feminist collective;
  - Establishing a committee focused on expanding sustainable, practical and experiential opportunities, particularly for non-Co-op students. GDS will request additional resources to support activities related to writing grants and applications, to liaise with the Development and Alumni Relations Office, and to seek new sources of support for placements and partnerships.
  - Review the curriculum with the goal of empowering students to reflect critically on the ethics of working with marginalized groups (i.e., IDSB07H3, Confronting Development’s Racist Past and Present).
  - Continue their review the Co-op admissions process. The Chair notes that, as of 2021-22 they are replacing in-person/zoom interviews with a series of short questions, with the goal of mitigating any anxiety associated with performing in front of an audience, and eliminating the possibility of any bias based on appearance. In addition, GDS will discuss and collaborate on ways to enable first year applicants (those enrolled in the IDS non-Co-op Major program) to apply, at the end of Year 1, for entry, in Year 2, into one of the Specialist Co-op programs. The department will be requesting new resources from the Dean’s Office to offer scholarships for exceptional applicants, with the goal of making Co-op more accessible and affordable. My office recognizes the importance of this program for GDS and for the campus and for ensuring equitable access to Co-op opportunities, and will work with the department and with the Development and Alumni Relations Office in assessing short-term and long-term supports.
- *The reviewers highlighted the need to ensure that the program curricula provide adequate and appropriate preparation for students prior to entering international co-op placements.*

In her Response letter, the Chair notes that students are guided to find volunteer/internship/short-term placements throughout their first 3 years to learn the expectations of office work and cross-cultural understanding (both through volunteer opportunities and as offered by the Co-op training in GDS). In addition, the program remains nimble to change; for example, students are no longer required to write bi-monthly reports in IDSD01Y3; instead, students will meet monthly with the Co-op Program Manager and Co-op Program Coordinator to discuss their experiences. Rather than writing reports while in country, students will be encouraged to use the preface section of their theses to reflect

on their placements and international travel experience. The department agrees with the reviewers that longer-term placements offer a vital opportunity for Co-op students and feel strongly that should they remain in place. The Chair notes that, in some cases, the length of the placement is determined by partner organizations. That said, as part of the GDS strategic visioning practices the department will think through, and articulate, the rationale for longer term placements and communicate this more clearly in a new IDS Co-op Handbook, as well as department messaging.

- *The reviewers noted student reports of harassment, discrimination, and unsafe living arrangements during their placements and highlighted the need to ensure that students receive appropriate support and communication.*

The Chair notes the department is working to strengthen their communications regarding the student expectations while abroad; for example, they have developed an IDS Co-op Handbook, which is being published as of Fall 2021, in which they will address, with as much transparency as possible, the costs associated with Co-op placements, the process of assigning placements, emergency services when abroad, mental health supports, and pre-departure check lists. The Chair further notes that, over the next 1 to 2 years, GDS will seek ways to prepare non-white and female students for the insidious ways racism and sexism emerge abroad. To facilitate this activity, the department is currently consulting with the Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Office (EDIO), at UTSC, on ways to establish supports for students who experience discrimination while on placement. They are also introducing a new B-level course as of Winter 2022 – IDSB07H3 (Confronting Development’s Racist Past and Present). This course will provide an “in-house” opportunity for students to learn about global racisms and their embeddedness in development. Together, the pre-departure briefings and course will prepare students, before they travel, for the global inequities they may face while on placement. Finally, GDS will consider whether there is a need for additional faculty members (with appropriate expertise and experience) to assist the Co-op Program Manager and Co-op Program Coordinator in mentoring students regarding racism and sexual discrimination while in the field. In addition to supporting GDS in their crucial program-specific work in this area, the Dean’s Office is prioritizing the development of campus-wide best practices and guidelines to support students preparing for Co-op and experiential learning placements, both locally and globally, drawing also on tri-campus resources and from the EDIO at UTSC.

- *The reviewers noted comments from some students in non co-op programs who feel that they receive less attention from faculty and staff than co-op students; the reviewers recommended enhancing learning opportunities and mentoring for students in these programs.*

In her Response, the Chair highlights some of the GDS’s existing initiatives, including a Research Mentorship Program, offered since 2015, that is available only to non-Co-op students; this program recruits up to 10 students a year to work one-on-one with a faculty member as a research assistant. Additionally, in 2020-21 the department introduced a senior thesis writing course (IDSD02H3) for non-Co-op students.

Having said that, the department agrees with the reviewers’ recommendation to expand the undergraduate thesis option as well as other student programming to include non-Co-op students. As of 2021-2022, GDS has established a committee to review non-Co-op student programming, and begin building innovative undergraduate opportunities including, but not limited to, experiential learning, research, mentoring, and public-speaking. The committee’s goal is to introduce, and advance, at least one new opportunity for non-Co-op students in the 2021-2022 academic year; it will continue to work over the next 1 to 5 years to create a robust set of learning opportunities that will include non-Co-op students, and also bring Co-op and non-Co-op students together into a more cohesive community of learners.

Enhancing learning opportunities and mentoring for students in non-Co-op programs will be a key priority for the new leadership team in GDS. Promoting a culture of belonging for all students in the department – not just students in Co-op and non-Co-op IDS programs, but also the newest group of students in the AFS programs – is a departmental priority. As part of the department’s visioning process they will design events and activities that will enable students from the multiple programs to work together on collective projects such as a proposal for a new International

Documentary Film Festival. Over the next 1 to 2 years, GDS will undertake outreach with the appropriate student groups, and invite their participation in this process.

- *The reviewers noted the need for increased clarification and consensus among faculty members about future directions for graduate program offerings.*

In her Response letter, the Chair confirms that over the next 1 to 2 years, GDS will engage in discussions regarding graduate program offerings and work towards a consensus around developing a stand-alone MA program, and/or expanding the existing Collaborative Specialization – Development Policy and Power to include PhDs. They will consult, as needed and appropriate, with me and the Vice-Dean Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies regarding resources needed to support these endeavors.

- *The reviewers encouraged faculty members to pursue additional and diverse research funding opportunities, through tri-council grants and other federal funding sources, as well as internal opportunities through the UTSC Office of the Vice-Principal Research and Innovation.*

As the Chair notes in her Response letter, GDS faculty are a diverse group of scholars who successfully win awards and funding from a variety of sources appropriate to their fields and disciplines such as SSHRC Insight Development & Insight Grants, Distinguished Professor Award, Canada Research Chair, Fulbright Scholarship, Royal Society of Canada Fellowship, Connaught Research Fellowships and more. Many faculty also include and hire GDS undergrads to participate on research projects. It would be helpful to emphasize, here, that there also exists a robust mentoring culture at UTSC, one in which each faculty member is paired with a mentor. The Vice-Dean Faculty Affairs, Equity, and Success is available as a resource for discussing frameworks and needs connected to mentorship to further support opportunities for GDS faculty in this area.

- *The reviewers noted the need for further divisional support, including from the Development and Alumni Relations Office, to fully realize CCDS's fundraising potential and to support its innovative programs.*

The Chair notes, in her Response letter, that GDS would welcome additional administrative support, particularly from Development and Alumni Relations Office (DARO), to design and market a strategy for ongoing fundraising to support the development and advance of innovative undergraduate programming in GDS. Access to co-op and experiential learning opportunities, particularly those with a global focus, are an explicit priority of DARO's emerging fundraising campaign for UTSC, which I expect will benefit GDS. My office is also committed to ensuring ongoing and future development of the outstanding programs for which the department is known.

The Dean's Office will monitor the implementation of recommendations through ongoing meetings with the Chair of the Department of Global Development Studies. A brief report to the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs, midway between the March 2021 site visit and the year of the next site visit, and no later than Winter 2025, will be prepared. The next external review of the Department has been scheduled for 2028-29.

Regards,



Professor William A. Gough  
Vice-Principal Academic & Dean

Cc: Professor Sharlene Mollett, Chair, Department of Global Development Studies, UTSC

## Implementation Plan

Action	Timeline	Lead
Publish the IDS Co-op Handbook	Short term (6 months)	Chair, GDS; IDS Co-op Manager
Hold department and committee meetings focused on establishing a set of core values for pedagogical practices, collective research priorities, daily operations and governance practices	Short term (6 months to 1 year)	Chair, GDS; Associate Chair, Judith Teichman
Advocate with the Office of the Dean to establish a "Practitioner-in-Residence"	Short term (6 months to 1 year)	Chair, GDS; IDS Co-op Manager
Review non-Co-op student programming and introduce at least one new opportunity	Short term (6 months to 1 year)	Chair, GDS; Associate Chair Ryan Isakson; Bettina Von Lieres; Caroline Hossein
Host department wide Open House for all students	Short term (6 months to 1 year)	Chair, GDS; IDS Co-op Manager
Expand Knowledge Equity lab and introduce GDS feminist collective	Short term (6 months to 1 year)	Chair, GDS; Leslie Chan
The Dean's Office will prioritize the development of campus-wide best practices and guidelines to support students preparing for Co-op and experiential learning placements, both locally and globally, drawing also on tri-campus resources and from the EDIO at UTSC	Medium term (1 year and ongoing)	Vice-Dean Teaching, Learning and Undergraduate Programs; Associate Dean Experiential and Global Learning
Review the admissions process for IDS programs, with the particular goal of creating pathways for students from non-Co-op programs into Co-op programs; request additional resources to ensure Co-op is accessible for more students	Medium term (1 to 2 years)	Chair, GDS; IDS Co-op Manager; Associate Chair Ryan Isakson
Engage in a comprehensive strategic planning and visioning process; including discussion of collective goals and values; GDS will seek the guidance of the Dean's Office and leverage available resources	Medium term (1 to 2 years)	Chair, GDS; Associate Chair, Judith Teichman; with department faculty
Work with the Dean's Office and the FCC process to add faculty complement focused on African Studies	Medium term (1 to 2 years)	Chair, GDS
Develop additional mechanisms to prepare non-white and female students for placements abroad	Medium term (1 to 2 years)	Chair, GDS; IDS Co-op Manager
Engage in discussions regarding graduate programs	Medium term (1 to 2 years)	Chair, GDS; Associate Chair, Judith Teichman; Anne-Emanuelle Birn
In 2023-24, hold a departmental retreat focused on aligning course offerings with departmental mission and values	Medium term (2 years)	Chair, GDS

<b>Action</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Lead</b>
Undertake outreach with the appropriate student groups, and invite their participation (medium term); Develop a strong list of experiential opportunities for students, ensuring they are sustainable (long term)	Medium to long term (1 to 5 years)	Chair, GDS; Bettina Von Lieres; IDS Co-op Manager
Fully integrate the AFS program into the department	Medium to long term (2 to 3 years)	Chair, GDS; Zubairu Wai, Caroline Hossein, Bettina Von Lieres, Thembela Kepe
Review IDS and AFS programs and courses; integrate courses from a more diverse range of disciplines into the IDS programs; review the title of the IDS programs	Medium to long term (2 to 4 years)	Chair, GDS; Associate Chair Ryan Isakson; Thembela Kepe; Zubairu Wai; Caroline Hossein; Bettina Von Lieres
Work with Dean's Office and the FCC process to add faculty complement focused on South/South East Asian Studies	Long term (3 to 5 years)	Chair, GDS



### 3. Committee on Academic Policy & Programs (AP&P) Findings

The spokesperson for the reading group reported that the review summary accurately reflected the full review. The group noted the administrative responses were extremely detailed and addressed most comments.

In response to a question by the reading group, Professor Sharlene Mollett, Chair, Department of Global Development Studies, commented on the issue of co-op students who identified the need for additional supports and alternative approaches to the pre-departure preparation and debriefing processes. Professor Mollett noted that:

- Students complete a debriefing at the end of their third year. The Department was augmenting pre-departure briefings with an expert who would provide a workshop on intersectional harassment and violence designed to help students mitigate and report sexual harassment and racial discrimination.
- When renewing partnership agreements, the University's expectations of how partners were to treat students working in those organizations would be communicated.
- A new required course called Confronting Development's Racist Past and Present had been developed to help students understand the existence of racism and other discriminations in international development globally.

No follow-up report was requested.

### 4. Institutional Executive Summary

The reviewers praised the International Development Co-op program as a flagship for CCDS and UTSC, and commented that the Centre is "a leader at UTSC and among IDS programs in Canada in providing exceptional learning opportunities for students outside the classroom"; they commended the Centre's strong level of reflection and innovation, which have enabled it to adapt to student needs and to the changing state of the world; they praised the very strong research output from CCDS faculty members, and the Centre's strong relationships with both cognate units and community-based organizations and NGOs; finally, they noted that CCDS has demonstrated impressive capacity to generate external funding for initiatives such as the Queen Elizabeth II Diamond Jubilee Scholarship and the Knowledge Equity Lab. The reviewers recommended that the following issues be addressed: undertaking a comprehensive strategic planning and visioning process to clarify future directions as the unit changes in status from an EDU:B to an academic department; expanding, enhancing and improving accessibility of co-op and broader experiential learning opportunities for all CCDS students; ensuring that the program curricula provide adequate and appropriate preparation for students prior to entering international co-op placements; addressing student reports of harassment, discrimination, and unsafe living arrangements during their placements; addressing non-co-op student concerns that they receive less faculty and staff attention than co-op students; increasing clarification and consensus among faculty members about future directions for graduate program offerings; encouraging faculty members to pursue additional and diverse research funding opportunities;

and enhancing Divisional support, to fully realize CCDS's fundraising potential and to support its innovative programs. The Dean's Administrative Response describes the Faculty, unit and programs' responses to the reviewers' recommendations, including an implementation plan for any changes necessary as a result.

## **5. Monitoring and Date of Next Review**

The Dean's Office will monitor the implementation of recommendations through ongoing meetings with the Chair of the Department of Global Development Studies (established July 2021).

The Dean will provide an interim report to the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs no later than Winter 2025 on the status of the implementation plans.

The next review will be commissioned in 2028-29.

## **6. Distribution**

On January 15, 2022, the Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan was posted to the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs website and the link provided by email to the Vice Principal Academic & Dean of UTSC, the Secretaries of AP&P, Academic Board and Governing Council, and the Ontario Universities Council on Quality Assurance. The Dean provided the link to the Chair of the Department.