

UTQAP Cyclical Review: Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan

1 Review Summary

Program(s) Reviewed:	Rotman Commerce programs: Accounting, BCom: Specialist Finance and Economics, BCom: Specialist Management, BCom: Specialist <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Foci (<i>available in all three programs</i>): Data Science in Business; Managing in Diverse Economies • Foci (<i>Management program only</i>): Finance; Financial Statement Analysis; International Business (U of T Global Scholar); Leadership in Organizations; Marketing; Strategy and Innovation Certificate in Business Fundamentals , Category 2 Certificate
Division/Unit Offering Program(s):	<i>Rotman Commerce</i> : Joint Program between the Faculty of Arts & Science and the Rotman School of Management <i>Certificate in Business Fundamentals</i> : Rotman School of Management
Commissioning Officer:	Dean, Faculty of Arts & Science Dean, Joseph L. Rotman School of Management
Reviewers (Name, Affiliation):	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Laura J. Kornish, Associate Dean of Undergraduate Affairs, Professor of Marketing, Leeds School of Business, University of Colorado Boulder • Brian W. Mayhew, Associate Dean, Undergraduate Programs, Arthur Andersen Alumni Professor, Department of Accounting and Information Systems, Wisconsin School of Business, University of Wisconsin-Madison • Michael A. Salinger, Jacqueline and Arthur Bahr Professor, Professor and Department Chair, Markets, Public Policy, and Law, Questrom School of Business, Boston University
Date of Review Visit:	April 10-11, 2023
Review Report Received by VPAP:	June 1, 2023
Administrative Response(s)	March 7, 2024
Date Reported to AP&P:	April 10, 2024

Previous UTQAP Review (Rotman Commerce program only)

Date: January 29-30, 2015

Summary of Findings and Recommendations

Significant Program Strengths

- Impressive students, faculty, staff, and alumni
- Students have benefitted from recent curricular innovations
- Excellent, high quality research conducted by both Arts & Science and Rotman faculty
- Program is widely recognized for its excellent graduates, particularly in the areas of accounting and finance
- Dedicated staff, who deliver high levels of service to students

Opportunities for Program Enhancement

- Finding the balance between liberal arts, economics, and business courses, including whether there should be more business courses in first year
- Leveraging the program's excellent location, high quality faculty, and the wonderful reputation of the Department of Economics and Rotman to improve the program, including further engaging Rotman faculty
- Addressing morale by improving student experience, advising and space
- Reflecting upon the roles of Rotman and the Faculty of Arts & Science in ensuring the program's success
- Considering the level of resources committed to the program in light of funding levels at similar programs

Current Review: Documentation and Consultation

Documentation Provided to Reviewers

Terms of reference; Self-study & Appendices; Previous review report including the administrative response; Access to all course descriptions; Access to the *curricula vitae* of faculty.

Consultation Process

Faculty, students, administrative staff and senior program administrators within the Faculty of Arts & Science and the Rotman School of Management, as well as members of relevant cognate units as determined by the commissioning officer.

Current Review: Findings and Recommendations

1. Undergraduate Program(s)

a. Rotman Commerce program

Unless otherwise noted, all bulleted comments apply to all programs reviewed.

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Overall quality
 - ▶ Rotman Commerce (RC) has a unique position in undergraduate business education; partnership between the Rotman School of Management (RSM) and the Faculty of Arts & Science (FAS) provides a more analytically rigorous program relative to other undergraduate business programs
 - ▶ Impressive program has made improvements since last review; “It plainly deserves its reputation as one of the top undergraduate business programs in Canada”
 - ▶ RC program is accredited by the Association to Advance Collegiate Schools of Business (AACSB), an important professional organization for undergraduate business programs
- Objectives
 - ▶ RC program aligns with the University’s goals to develop thoughtful citizens who can think critically
 - ▶ Depth of economics education and associated mathematics are hallmarks of the RC program’s rigor
 - ▶ AACSB-accredited programs generally have a curriculum that is approximately half business courses; RC programs include a uniquely strong concentration in math and economics in the “other half”, giving “differentiating depth” to program
 - ▶ Impressive general design of the Finance and Economics specialist; program prepares students well for employment in the finance industry.
 - ▶ Design of the Accounting specialist meets the regulatory requirements to become a Certified Professional Accountant (CPA), as accredited by CPA Canada
 - ▶ [Accounting] Consolidation of two Accounting streams in 2019-20 is consistent with the goals of the realigned curriculum
- Admissions requirements
 - ▶ Admissions processes are appropriate
 - ▶ RC admissions officers undergo training to reduce potential implicit bias in evaluating admissions video components; process also includes multiple reviewers for each video
- Curriculum and program delivery
 - ▶ RC curriculum, particularly in quantitative analysis, highly rigorous in comparison with other undergraduate business programs
 - ▶ Curriculum changes since last review created a course requirements structure in which students have increased flexibility to choose to take a certain number of

- courses at either FAS or RSM depending on their specific interests; the increased flexibility benefits students and allows for curricular innovation
- ▶ [Finance and Economics] Impressive integration between FAS and RSM course offerings:
 - FAS Microeconomics courses are customized for RC students to apply the analytical rigor of microeconomic analysis to business problems
 - RSM finance faculty expressed satisfaction with the background in macroeconomics that students brought to their finance electives
 - FAS statistics course places more emphasis on practical skills than other undergraduate business programs' courses; course includes training on working with real financial data sets and presenting data clearly
 - ▶ [Accounting] Program has been updated to include more analytics-based courses
 - ▶ Structure in which students complete the RC Accounting specialist followed by additional graduate-level courses in order to qualify for the CPA in Canada is consistent with US standards
 - ▶ Management Specialist allows students to focus in a particular area; number of courses required to complete a focus area (2.5-3 credits) is consistent with concentrations or majors at other undergraduate business programs
 - Accessibility and diversity
 - ▶ RC has a large and very diverse international student population
 - Assessment of learning
 - ▶ RSM and FAS apply very rigorous assessment of students, with wide grade distributions; assessment tools include a mix of homework, participation, and exam grades
 - Student engagement, experience and program support services
 - ▶ Shared program governance between RSM and FAS helps RC students' academic experience to be better integrated into the fabric of university academic life than students in similar programs
 - ▶ Centre for Professional Skills (CPS) has worked effectively with faculty to embed writing and presentation skills within RC courses; CPS supports development of students' soft skills such as teamwork, communication, and ethical decision making
 - ▶ CPS is a strong initiative that enhances the quality of the RC program and the associated learning and teaching environment; "Other schools may claim to have soft skills development, but this rigorous delivery at scale for RC's CPS is a differentiator"
 - ▶ High level of teaching assistant support enables RC to recruit working professionals as TA's, "which is unique in our experience and creates a valuable connection to alumni as well as expertise shared with students"
 - ▶ Reviewers praised faculty initiatives to provide experiences that combine academic support with socializing to "help busy students get both things they need efficiently"
 - ▶ Strong investment in student services staff supports academic advising, career services, and other student support
 - ▶ Faculty praised RC students as strong and intellectually curious

- ▶ Students appreciate the applied nature of RC curriculum and faculty efforts to keep course material current and relevant
- ▶ RC students participate in the FAS “College” system which complements the academic program and provides social and personal support
- Quality indicators – undergraduate students
 - ▶ RC program attracts high quality applicants; high percentage (~90%) of admitted students progress to RC in their second year through the Guaranteed Admission process
 - ▶ Very high completion rate for RC students highlights the quality of RC students

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Admissions requirements
 - ▶ Large majority of admitted students progress to the program through Guaranteed Admission, but the process creates “substantial stress and may contribute to why a surprisingly large fraction of RC students are reluctant to recommend the program”
 - ▶ Significant proportion (~15-20%) of students progress to the program by retaking a course in the summer session; reviewers observe that the stress created by the need to “clinch” entry into the program may be preventing students from connecting with the RC community during their first year
- Curriculum and program delivery
 - ▶ Reviewers note steadily declining enrolment in the Accounting specialist, attributed in part to trends that are not specific to RC: lower starting salaries in Accounting relative to entry-level positions in Finance, and the number of required courses and additional graduate-level requirements needed to earn the CPA designation
 - ▶ [Management] Rotman Commerce does not offer a focus in operations management, a field offered by “most undergraduate business programs”
 - ▶ [Management] Reviewers question why RC offers both the specialist program in Finance and Economics as well as the Finance focus within the Management specialist
 - ▶ [Management] Reviewers comment that the Focus in Financial Statement Analysis appears to be a more granular topic than others that are offered in the RC program and in other undergraduate business programs (e.g., Marketing, Finance, Strategy and Innovation, and International Business)
- Assessment of learning
 - ▶ “RSM faculty expressed some frustration that FAS rules against the use of computers in exams stand in the way of authentic assessments, particularly in courses on analytics”
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
 - ▶ Stress due to students’ needing to achieve certain first year marks for admission to the program in second year may prevent students from connecting with RC community
 - ▶ Reviewers note concerning survey data regarding student morale in the Self-Study, particularly the low percentage of students who “definitely would” recommend the program to other students

- ▶ Challenges building a strong sense of community may be a source of the relatively low (albeit improving) net promoter score among RC students
- ▶ Assigning students to a cohort within RC does not appear to have gained much traction in terms of building community within the program
- ▶ The rate at which Rotman Commerce students study overseas appears to be below that of other business schools
- ▶ Reviewers found the ratio of over 3000 students to 5 academic advisors to be low, but noted that advising staff did not have a strong negative reaction to their caseloads
- ▶ Low participation in RC student clubs; students commented that they “were reluctant to get involved in clubs unless they could have a leadership position”
- ▶ Students commented on stress experienced during first year, including anxiety about receiving marks necessary to continue in the program, desire for more autonomy in governance of the student organizations, and stress associated with securing post-graduation employment
- ▶ Students expressed desire for more guidance and structure in securing work experience and entering competitive career paths, e.g., consulting
- ▶ Reviewers observe that a disconnect in students’ understanding of the different grading scales used between high school and the University may cause “grade shock” for students; noting that “we do find it plausible that student stress about performance interferes with them feeling attached to the school”
- ▶ Despite increase in the number of RC students who would definitely or probably recommend the program, reviewers note that there continues to be room for improvement in this “net promoter” score given the program quality.
- Quality indicators – undergraduate students
 - ▶ Reviewers observe that students who respond to post-graduation employment surveys are more likely to be employed and note that employment rate statistics may be overstated as a result

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Admissions requirements
 - ▶ Modify program admission procedures to admit students directly to RC in their first year in order to alleviate student stress over first year grades, improve net promoter score, facilitate competing for top students, and to align with other North American programs that have moved to direct admission
 - ▶ Consider changes in admissions process, curriculum, student supports, and/or grading to lower the rate of students needing to attend summer courses in order to qualify for entry into the program in their second year
 - ▶ “Counseling out students who struggle academically is an alternative way to achieve the academic value of progression”
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
 - ▶ Prioritize and support efforts to foster students’ sense of community
 - ▶ Investigate whether other undergraduate business programs in Canada provide students with active assistance or advocacy in securing post-graduation employment

- ▶ Explore ways to encourage and facilitate pre-graduation professional experiences to help RC students augment their professional skills, including internships or part-time employment in a professional setting
- ▶ Explore ways to increase the rate at which RC students study overseas
- ▶ Reviewers endorse efforts to reduce student stress and expand participation by reconsidering the competitive “hiring” process for student clubs
- ▶ Concentrate on building community and improving career outcomes in order to reduce stress and improve student satisfaction
- Quality indicators – undergraduate students
 - ▶ Consider benchmarking against other leading Canadian undergraduate business programs in order to determine how RC compares with respect to employment rates and starting salaries
 - ▶ Use “full population reporting” to track students’ post-graduation plans and employment rates

b. Certificate in Business Fundamentals

Unless otherwise noted, all bulleted comments apply to all programs reviewed.

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Objectives
 - ▶ Certificate program fills an important need to provide fundamental business coverage to non-business majors; “We applaud the creation of this Certificate”
 - ▶ Certificate includes basic learning objectives consistent with providing a fundamental understanding of business as a discipline, with appropriate depth of coverage for a certificate program
- Admissions requirements
 - ▶ Certificate is open to any FAS student who has completed 4.0 credits and the MGT100 course; “this provides an appropriate level of access to this credential”
- Curriculum and program delivery
 - ▶ Program structure is appropriate and consistent with similar programs at other North American universities
 - ▶ Curriculum design “is both simple and elegant” covering four basic components of business: accounting, finance, management, and marketing
- Assessment of learning
 - ▶ Courses included in the Certificate follow the standard grading and assessment of other RC courses and should be similarly effective in achieving learning objectives
- Student engagement, experience and program support services
 - ▶ Students in the Certificate program commented that they were happy to have the opportunity to pair business knowledge with their undergraduate degrees in other disciplines

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Student engagement, experience and program support services
 - ▶ Some confusion noted among Certificate students regarding their ability to participate in Rotman Commerce-related extracurricular activities (e.g., student clubs), with Certificate students expressing some desire to participate more broadly in these activities; reviewers note a lack of clarity as to whether this participation would be welcomed by RC degree program students

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Curriculum and program delivery
 - ▶ Consider adding Operations as a subject area, and allowing students to choose among courses in marketing, finance, and operations
 - ▶ Consider and confirm the optimal course prerequisite structure for each individual subject area
 - ▶ Consider methods such as peer review of courses to ensure that the Certificate curriculum remains current

2. Graduate Program(s) n/a

3. Faculty/Research

- Reviewers note: “Rotman Commerce is a joint program of RSM and FAS and as such, it does not have faculty or research independently from its parents. Thus, we did not review this dimension.”

4. Administration

Note: Issues that are addressed through specific University processes and therefore considered out of scope for UTQAP reviews (e.g., individual Human Resources issues, specific health and safety concerns) are routed to proper University offices to be addressed, and are therefore not included in the Review Summary component of the Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan.

a. Rotman Commerce program

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Relationships
 - ▶ Strong relationships between and among program faculty and staff
 - ▶ Atmosphere of mutual respect and cooperation between FAS and RSM faculty teaching in the program

- ▶ “Harmonious and respectful” relationships between research stream and teaching stream faculty
- ▶ Strong staff morale undiminished by recent organizational changes
- Organizational and financial structure
 - ▶ FAS and RSM work well together to administer the program, FAS provides rigorous mathematics and economics training while RSM provides a strong quantitative approach to business
 - ▶ Faculty from both FAS and RSM are well informed and connected to what each provides in their respective courses
 - ▶ Reviewers note improvements since the last review in coordination and administration, to support more efficient decision-making and manage the program more effectively
 - ▶ Recent reorganization of Career Services office was designed to better serve students; reviewers recognize the decision as courageous and difficult, but important for long-term health of the program
 - ▶ RC program generally appears to allocate financial resources to instruction effectively; strong TA support for grading, which allows instructors to provide effective feedback to students through human-graded assignments
 - ▶ RC program has benefited from strong leadership despite shorter recent tenures of individuals serving as program Director; “While turnover has challenges, the institutional memory is served by so many individuals having shared in the leadership experience”
 - ▶ New Director in place for a five-year term will enable long-range planning
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
 - ▶ Reviewers support the logic behind creation of the RC Advancement team, particularly to support a capital campaign for upcoming building construction; they acknowledge that joining forces with the larger RSM Advancement office would have also been a logical choice
- International comparators
 - ▶ RC program has strong footing by virtue of its place within a highly-ranked University and its connection to a highly-ranked business school

The reviewers identified the following **areas of concern**:

- Relationships
 - ▶ “The one relationship that seemed the most strained was the relationship between the students and the program”
- Organizational and financial structure
 - ▶ Reviewers note that space remains a challenge for the RC program, with long-range plans for a new building still several years away from completion
 - ▶ Classrooms, staff offices, study rooms, and event space are in different locations which creates challenges to staff collaboration and building a sense of community within the program as there is no natural place for students to congregate
 - ▶ Classrooms dedicated to some core RC classes lacked relatively standard technology for course delivery such as custom-installed software; several faculty members

- described challenges with teaching their upper division classes in the manner they preferred due to the lack of classroom technology; reviewers note these issues could be addressed prior to new building construction
- ▶ Staff and faculty stressed the need to update the RC facilities; issues related to space and facilities are “too urgent to wait” for a new building to be constructed

The reviewers made the following **recommendations**:

- Organizational and financial structure
 - ▶ Reviewers strongly support advocacy for a new RC building to centralize program staff and house many RC classes in a single location
 - ▶ With planned new building still several years away, reviewers strongly urge the University to explore ways to provide additional space for the RC program and greater access to modern classrooms in the meantime
 - ▶ Reviewers support current plans to secure existing campus space for a student commons in a “long lease” arrangement; such a space would allow for planning and responsiveness for students’ needs

b. Certificate in Business Fundamentals

The reviewers observed the following **strengths**:

- Organizational and financial structure
 - ▶ Certificate program is appropriately overseen by the joint RSM and FAS Divisions
 - ▶ Program appears to be funded sufficiently
- Long-range planning and overall assessment
 - ▶ Reviewers expect the Certificate to be popular and that enrollment will grow
- International comparators
 - ▶ Certificate curriculum is consistent with international business schools



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF ARTS & SCIENCE

**Rotman
Commerce**

March 7, 2024

Professor Susan McCahan
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
University of Toronto

RE: UTQAP bundled cyclical review of Rotman Commerce Program & Certificate in Business Fundamentals

Dear Prof. McCahan,

We write in response to your letter of December 13, 2023, regarding the April 10-11, 2023, bundled UTQAP cyclical review [held remotely], of the Rotman Commerce Program, a joint program between the Faculty of Arts and Science and the Rotman School of Management, and the undergraduate Certificate in Business Fundamentals, offered by the Rotman School of Management, and requesting our Administrative Responses.

The following programs were reviewed: Accounting (BCom): Specialist; Finance and Economics (BCom): Specialist; Management (BCom): Specialist; Focus in Finance; Focus in Financial Statement Analysis; Focus in International Business (U of T Global Scholar); Focus in Leadership in Organizations; Focus in Marketing; Focus in Strategy and Innovation; Focus in Data Science in Business; Focus in Managing in Diverse Economies; Certificate in Business Fundamentals.

On behalf of the Faculty of Arts & Science, we would first like to thank the reviewers, Professor Laura Kornish, Leeds School of Business, University of Colorado Boulder, Professor Brian W. Mayhew, Wisconsin School of Business, University of Wisconsin-Madison, and Professor Michael A. Salinger, Questrom School of Business, Boston University, for their very comprehensive review of the Rotman Commerce Program and the Certificate in Business Fundamentals. We would also like to thank the Rotman Commerce Program director, faculty, administrative staff, and all those who contributed to the preparation of the self-study. We also wish to thank the many staff, students, and faculty members who met with the external reviewers and provided thoughtful feedback. The UTQAP cyclical review process is an invaluable exercise that affords us the opportunity to take stock of our academic units and programs, to recognize achievement, and identify areas for improvement.

The review report was finalized on June 1, 2023, after which the director shared it widely with faculty, staff, and students in the program and at RSM. We are extremely pleased with the reviewers' positive assessment of the overall strength of Rotman Commerce Program and the Certificate and their outstanding, productive faculty.

The reviewers noted effective coordination across both FAS & RSM and their courses. With respect to Rotman Commerce, reviewers commented on the high rigour of its curriculum and particularly attention to quantitative analysis; its very rigorous assessment of students; the diverse international student population; the program's high completion rates; and strong investment in student and career services including the strength of the Centre for Professional Skills. The review report also raised several issues and challenges and identified areas for enhancement, including building a stronger sense of community among students; classrooms and technology below industry standard; exploring ways to encourage and facilitate pre-graduation professional experiences; and low student morale. For the Certificate in Business Fundamentals administered by RSM, reviewers noted that the Certificate fills an important need to provide fundamental business coverage to non-business majors, and that the design of the program is both simple and elegant. They also noted, however, that the Certificate does not include operations, which could be considered essential for a basic background in business, and also suggested that the introductory course for Certificate courses be reconsidered as a prerequisite.

Each of these recommendations has been addressed in the attached Review Recommendations Table that outlines the unit's response, the Deans' responses, and an Implementation Plan identifying action items and timelines for each recommendation. Our Administrative Response and Implementation Plan was developed in consultation with the Director of the Rotman Commerce Program, the Managing Director of the Rotman Commerce Program, along with the Associate-Dean, Unit-Level Reviews, and senior leadership within both our offices. The Implementation Plan provided identifies timeframes of immediate- (six months), medium- (one to two years), and longer- (three to five years) term actions and who (Faculty, Dean, unit) will take the lead in each area. We have also identified any necessary changes in organization, policy, or governance where appropriate, as well as any resources, financial or otherwise, that will be provided, and who will provide them.

The next UTQAP cyclical review of Rotman Commerce Program and the undergraduate Certificate in Business Fundamentals will take place no later than the 2030-31 review cycle. The A&S Dean's office monitors progress on Implementation Plans through periodic meetings with unit leadership. We also acknowledge that your office will request a brief Interim Monitoring Report midway between the 2022-23 UTQAP cyclical review and the year of the next site visit during the 2030-31 review cycle to report on progress made on the Implementation Plan as outlined in the accompanying Review Recommendations Table.

Thank you very much for the opportunity to respond to the review report. The reviewers' comments and recommendations will help inform the future priorities of the Rotman Commerce Program and the undergraduate Certificate in Business Fundamentals.

Sincerely,



Melanie Woodin
Dean, Faculty of Arts & Science
Professor of Cell & Systems Biology



Susan Christoffersen
Dean, Rotman School of Management
Professor of Finance

cc.

Catherine Barrette, Director, Rotman Commerce, Rotman School of Management
Leanne Pollard, Managing Director, Rotman Commerce, Rotman School of Management
Gillian Hamilton, Vice-Dean, Academic Planning, Faculty of Arts & Science
Suzanne Wood, Interim Associate Dean, Unit-Level Reviews, Faculty of Arts & Science
Lachmi Singh, Director, Academic Programs, Planning & Quality Assurance, Office of the Vice-
Provost, Academic Programs
Andrea Benoit, Academic Planning & Review Officer, Office of the Dean, Faculty of Arts and
Science
Amanda Pullan, Academic Planning & Review Officer, Office of the Dean, Faculty of Arts and
Science

2022-23 UTQAP Review of the FAS Rotman Commerce joint program with Rotman School of Management + Certificate in Business Fundamentals - Review Recommendations

Please do the following for each recommendation in the table:

- If you **intend** to act on a recommendation, please provide an **Implementation Plan** identifying actions to be taken, the time frame (short, medium, long term) for each, and who will take the lead in each area. If appropriate, please identify any necessary changes in organization, policy or governance; and any resources, financial and otherwise, that will be provided, and who will provide them.
- If you **do not** intend to act on a recommendation, please briefly explain why the actions recommended have not been prioritized.
- In accordance with the UTQAP and Ontario's Quality Assurance Framework, "it is important to note that, while the external reviewers' report may include **commentary** on issues such as faculty complement and/or space requirements when related to the quality of the program under review, **recommendations** on these or any other elements that are within the purview of the university's internal budgetary decision-making processes must be tied directly to issues of program quality or sustainability" (emphasis added)
- You may wish to refer to the [sample table](#) provided by the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs

Request Prompt <i>verbatim from the request</i>	Rec. #	Recommendations from Review Report <i>verbatim from the review report</i>	Program Response	Dean's Response
The reviewers recommended that the current admission processes for the Rotman Commerce program be reconsidered, noting that changes may help to alleviate substantial student stress, help build community in the program, and enhance competitiveness among other undergraduate business programs.	1	"Directly admit students to Rotman Commerce in their first year without the formal progression requirement. About 90% of admitted students progress to RC through the Guaranteed Admission requirements. The screen is not doing much to weed out students who do not belong, but it does create substantial stress and may contribute to why a surprisingly large fraction of RC students are reluctant to recommend the program."	<p>Consultations across Rotman Commerce and the Economics department have concluded that this may not be the only solution to the issues raised. This type of full-scale change has significant implications for the tuition fee structure that could adversely affect some students, and for the program requirements in upper-year Economics courses. As such, the program will not be acting on this recommendation based on the rationale below.</p> <p>If Rotman Commerce directly admitted students to the program in Y1 without the formal progression requirements, students would be required to pay the higher deregulated fee in Y1, as opposed to Arts & Science Y1 fees. For the 8-10% of students who do not continue in Rotman Commerce in Y2, paying this higher fee in Y1 is inequitable.</p> <p>Achieving a 63% in ECO101H and ECO102H is a pre-requisite for the 200-level ECO courses,</p>	<p>The Deans support the program's response in that the Reviewers' Recommendation may not be the only solution. As outlined in the program response, this type of change would have broader implications than simply reducing a step in the overall admissions process and could have negative financial implications for some students. The Deans will support the ongoing discussions between Rotman Commerce and the A&S Department of Economics regarding the program's admissions requirements.</p> <p>The Deans also prompted the program to consider alternative solutions to address student stress arising from such admission requirements and to enhance student community. Some solutions are discussed in the program response throughout this document.</p>

			<p>for all students. Students who are not required to meet a minimum threshold in ECO101H and ECO102H before tackling the more advanced and increasingly difficult ECO 200-level course would not be set up for success. The Economics department had concerns with reducing this requirement for the Rotman Commerce students, as this would cause an inequity with all other students pursuing an Economics minor.</p> <p>Removing the Guaranteed Admission requirements may prolong the inevitable realization for some students that they will struggle to pass some of the ECO 200-level courses, and other RSM courses such as RSM270H, RSM332H, RSM333H, which require stronger technical/quantitative skills. Annually, for the 8 to 10% of an incoming cohort who do not advance to Y2, this early screen allows for an easier transition to pursue an alternative program or other options at the end of Y1.</p>	
<p>The reviewers highlighted concerns and made recommendations related to improving student satisfaction and building a sense of community within the program.</p>	2	<p>“Whether through changes in admissions, curriculum, student support, or grading, Rotman Commerce should strive for a much lower rate of students needing to attend summer school. Freshman year is essential for building community, particularly given how many students live off campus after freshman year. The stress created by the need to clinch may be preventing students from connecting with RC during their first year.”</p>	<p>Recognizing the academic challenges in Y1 requiring students to repeat courses and in Y2 with ECO courses, Rotman Commerce will immediately increase our efforts to promote the ECO and Math PUMP prep modules in the summer preceding Y1 through the Arrive Ready program. In Summer 2023, only 20 Rotman Commerce admitted students participated in the first Math PUMP module, and only 8 in the second module.</p> <p>Through future consultations (medium term action) with the ECO and MATH departments, Rotman Commerce would like to suggest a</p>	<p>The Deans support the program’s steps as outlined. The A&S Dean’s office will offer support to RC leadership in liaising with the A&S Math and Economics departments to support increased student enrolment in the PUMP modules and to revisit any discussions on grading expectations and student performance.</p>

			<p>screening tool to encourage enrolment in those supports based on individual assessments.</p> <p>Rotman Commerce will immediately undertake a review of the current academic support programs (e.g. ECO Study Centre, Math Aid Centre, RC Peer Tutor Network, Second Year Learning Communities) to consider enhancing resources (e.g. subsidizing additional tutoring supports for students at risk). Proactive advising will be critical, including adoption of an early alert program to identify and reach these students.</p> <p>Through conversations with both the Math and the Economics departments, grading expectations and student performance have been consistent over time. Arbitrarily adjusting the grade distributions would not serve students well, as grades signal their mastery of the subject matter. Again, this foundational preparation is essential for upper-year quantitative courses in the program.</p>	
3		<p>“RC’s net promoter score has improved from 27.8% in 2018-9 to 43.1% last year. While that improvement constitutes progress, only 64% of respondents answered that they would definitely or probably recommend the program to someone interested in a business program. Given the quality of the program, that number should be higher. To improve it, the committee recommends concentrating on building community and improving career outcomes... Direct admission to the program and reducing the rate at which students take courses in the summer after freshman year should improve student (and parent) satisfaction and, by reducing what is likely unproductive stress, make it easier to engage students in community activities during the critical freshman year.”</p>	<p>In this next admissions cycle (intake Fall 2024) Rotman Commerce will invite admitted students to our Discord community platform once admitted, to start to build the community (as opposed to only including the students who accepted their offers). Recruitment & Admissions staff will monitor and moderate the discussions to support admits during this critical yield season.</p> <p>Rotman Commerce Student Life (RCSL) recently (2023-2024) suspended the first-year internship program for all student groups. This program aimed to offer internship</p>	<p>The Deans recognize the important work that the program has undertaken to improve student satisfaction with the program.</p> <p>A&S wishes to flag the existing programming within the Faculty to support undergraduate students, in particular for those in their First year, including “Arrive Ready,” the First Year Learning Communities (which include a Rotman Commerce specific stream), Recognized Study Groups, as well as the University’s existing mentorship programs, many of which are tailored to specific groups of students.</p>

		<p>positions to first-year students, providing them with insights into the inner workings of student groups during the academic year. However, only limited opportunities were available, leading to a scenario where many first-year students applied to multiple groups, only to face rejections repeatedly. This feeling of rejection resulted in many students feeling disheartened and demoralized, invoking feelings of inadequacy, self-doubt, and even anxiety about their experience at Rotman Commerce.</p> <p>This change has resulted in increased event attendance across all student group activities. It enabled first-year students to engage with student groups at their own pace, and to build relationships with multiple groups that align more closely with their interests and goals, fostering a more diverse and fulfilling university experience. Additionally, this change allowed first-year students the opportunity to explore various extracurricular activities without the pressure of securing a specific internship, enabling them to discover new passions and talents they may not have otherwise explored.</p> <p>Further, in 2023-2024, RCSL now requires student groups to include one event primarily focused on community building to receive subsidy funding. This ensures a minimum of 27 events aimed at fostering friendships and long-lasting relationships.</p> <p>It was noted in the Innovation Hub report that: <i>Rotman Commerce students had plenty of positive feedback about their extracurricular experiences, where they feel they have given plenty of choice with the</i></p>	<p>A&S and Rotman have jointly increased investment in the RC Program Office to support staff and programming, with the Centre for Professional Skills (CPS) as a recent marquee initiative, and additional advising and careers staff and services.</p> <p>The Deans also applaud the program's initiative to form the Rotman Commerce Equity, Diversity, Decolonization, Inclusion and Accessibility (EDDIA) Working Group and the continued work of this group. The Director, EDI of A&S is available to connect with the Director, EDI of RSM for consultation and collaboration.</p>
--	--	---	---

			<p><i>diverse student groups and activities available to them, as well as professional development resources.</i> Rotman Commerce will continue to refine our programming to provide opportunities for students to connect in as many ways as possible, to meet their various needs and expectations.</p> <p>One of the key features of the Rotman Commerce experience is skill development through Centre for Professional Skills (CPS). CPS to date has been focused on building communication and interpersonal skills, teamwork, & academic integrity and will be adding intercultural fluency in 2024-2025.</p> <p>In 2023-2024, CPS undertook a project to map all professional skills currently being taught in the curriculum with a plan to scaffold professional skills across all 4 years of the program. Additional TA resources will need to be deployed to support skills assessments and feedback.</p> <p>Long-term, CPS aspires to build out skill development in a structured way both in the curriculum and in co-curricular offerings, to provide pathways for students to develop individual skills, based on an early assessment (e.g. through the supplemental application or a mandatory first year deliverable/assessment). Additional staffing resources may be required as this project develops.</p> <p>The mastery of transferable professional skills should improve students' overall satisfaction with their self-development and growth while also increasing their ability to obtain their desired career outcome.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

			<p>Rotman Commerce recently (Fall 2023) formalized a multi-year recruitment outreach strategy including specific programming for equity-deserving groups as well as a suite of events and activities for the wider prospective student community. All activities are designed to be appropriate for an undergraduate business program and are approached through the lenses of inclusivity and accessibility.</p> <p>The Rotman Commerce Equity, Diversity, Decolonization, Inclusion and Accessibility (EDDIA) Working Group was established in October 2023 with the mandate to create an inclusive environment for students, staff, faculty, internal and external clients. The Working Group will actively work towards embedding EDDIA principles into processes, events, and programs through strategic, coordinated and community informed practices.</p> <p>Some of the EDDIA initiatives include (but are not limited to): developing a climate/pulse survey for students (March 2024 launch); defining and arranging a series of EDDIA professional development workshops for students (2024-2025 academic year); partnering with the Rotman Commerce Students' Association (RCSA) to provide guidance/support on designing inclusive and accessible initiatives (2024 winter); and developing a communications strategy for how to a) engage the community in EDDIA actions, b) how to tell our story, c) formal reporting.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

<p>Noting that “the rate at which Rotman Commerce students’ study overseas appears to be below the rate at other business schools”, the reviewers recommended that the program explore ways to increase students’ opportunities to gain international experience.</p>	4	<p>“Increase rate at which students’ study overseas. The rate at which Rotman Commerce students study overseas appears to be below the rate at other business schools.”</p>	<p>The Rotman Commerce Director, our Director of Academic Services & Student Life, and our Academic Advisor, Intercultural Learning & Experience have recently developed a multi-year strategic plan for international exchange (2023-2027) to provide Rotman Commerce students with diversified academic, professional, and experiential opportunities.</p> <p>Objectives include:</p> <p>Academic Excellence: seek partnerships with reputable business schools where the curriculum easily translates and complements the Rotman Commerce curriculum. Prioritize the formation of partnerships with programs that offer experiential education components.</p> <p>Global Impact and Social Responsibility: Attain a participation rate of 20% of the graduating class, participating in an exchange over the course of their degree.</p> <p>Mutually Beneficial Partnerships: Review existing partnerships on a 5-year basis, according to a 'partnership review card'.</p> <p>Engagement Emphasizing a Sense of Belonging: Initiate the Global Learning Ambassadors program to connect inbound and outbound exchange students and encourage cross-cultural exchange.</p> <p>International Fluencies: Offer students programming for language and intercultural competency skills development with the support of the Centre for Professional Skills.</p>	<p>The Deans are supportive of Rotman Commerce’s strategic plan for international exchange (2023-2027) and efforts to attain greater student participation in exchanges.</p>
<p>The reviewers observed a lack of clarity in the mix of focus options offered</p>	5	<p>“... why does RC have both a specialist in Finance and</p>	<p>The Finance and Economics Specialist POST is a staple program of the Rotman Commerce</p>	<p>The Deans note the value of both the Finance and Economics specialist and the Finance</p>

<p>through the Rotman Commerce programs.</p>		<p>Economics and a finance focus in the Management stream? One student explained that he chose the finance focus in the Management stream to avoid tougher grading in the additional economics courses (intermediate macro, presumably) in the Finance and Economics stream. While the comment was from just one student, we are unclear as to why Rotman Commerce offers both options.”</p>	<p>program and stems from our history with the Faculty of the Arts & Science. It is a challenging program with the requirement to complete multiple advanced courses in Economics. In 2019, when the curriculum review occurred, it was noted that there is a wide range of careers in the Finance field and not all of them required the extent of Economics knowledge that is required to complete the Finance and Economics Specialist.</p> <p>Therefore, the Finance Focus was created to respond to this need and allow students to combine this focus with another interest or requirement such as the Data Science in Business Focus or the Strategy and Innovation focus which can be combined to meet the specific skills that a desired role may require. The creation of the Finance Focus was not meant to be an “easy way out” but rather a recognition of the variety of different skill combinations that are required by the vast array of positions available in this field.</p> <p>As the Finance and Economics Specialist had 1038 students registered in it and the Finance focus was the second most popular focus with 427 students registered for the 2023-24, we are confident that the current offering responds to the needs of our students.</p>	<p>focus; as the program response notes, the specialist and focus options serve different learning needs and career plans among program students.</p>
<p>The reviewers recommended that Rotman Commerce “continue to iterate on the way that Career Services serves students,” with recommendations to explore ways to encourage and facilitate pre-graduation professional experiences, investigate the types of</p>	<p>6</p>	<p>“Continue to iterate on the way that Career Services serves students. Given the strength of the students it attracts, Rotman Commerce should be at the top of Canadian undergraduate business programs with respect to employment rates and starting salaries. We were not able to ascertain whether it is. We suggest benchmarking</p>	<p>Rotman Commerce is at the top of Canadian Undergraduate business programs with respect to employment rates. 2022-2023 rates (from each school’s employment report): Ivey (Western) – 97% Schulich (York) – 85%</p>	<p>The Deans support the program’s benchmarking initiatives. Both Faculties have made significant investments in the program to ensure that Rotman Commerce is indeed among the very top undergraduate business programs in Canada.</p>

<p>career services offered by other similar programs, and identify benchmarks to gain insights for enhancing post-graduation employment rates and starting salaries.</p>		<p>against other leading Canadian undergraduate business programs.”</p>	<p>Smith (Queen’s) – 96% Desautels (McGill) – 80% Rotman Commerce – 94%</p> <p>Reporting starting salaries is more difficult, as it is an optional field. Rotman Commerce made it mandatory in the past, and respondents skipped the entire survey. Ivey and Schulich consistently report starting salaries; what's not known is their methodology, specifically the response rate.</p> <p>For the last 4 years, Rotman Commerce has asked for starting salaries and sign-on bonuses but receives very few responses to these questions. Because of the low response rate and limited data available, we lack confidence in reporting this figure.</p>	
	7	<p>“RC Career Services should investigate whether other Canadian schools provide their students with more active assistance and even advocacy in securing positions at desirable companies.”</p>	<p>Rotman Commerce has one of the largest and well-funded Career Services (CS) departments across the University. The services we provide go far beyond basic resume and job search strategy workshops to include level-up experiences to better prepare career decision-making.</p> <p>The CS unit helps guide students through a data-driven strength-finding assessment then helps them understand themselves as young professionals by identifying their strengths and values. CS then assists them in goal setting and helping them build the tools necessary to market themselves and exposes them to a wide range of programs which ultimately manifests into their career.</p> <p>CS’s philosophy is to give students an education on career management and how to manage a rewarding career versus placing</p>	<p>Both Faculties have provided financial support to the program to ensure excellent career services are provided to Rotman Commerce students. The Deans appreciate and support the work of the Career Services team in its initiatives to support students in their career goals, and to remain competitive with peer programs.</p>

			<p>them in roles. This approach builds success and influence in the business marketplace, strengthens the Rotman name and a sense of community.</p> <p>The CS unit was restructured in 2022, and now includes a role dedicated to corporate relations that is focused on reviving dormant relationships and establishing new corporate partners in Canada and around the world. The corporate relations strategy is informed by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Y1 survey asking students to report career aspirations, industry, function and geography; • Employment outcome trends of graduating students; one-on-one and group interactions with current students; industry trends and global hiring demands. <p>The Rotman School's academic plan (2022-2027) outlines key performance indicators for career services including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase the number and diversity of Rotman-engaged employers, both in Canada and abroad. • Increase the number and variety of job postings in a wider range of industries. • Maintain our high record of employment – 90% +, 9 months post-convocation. <p>CS defined annual targets for the Academic Plan KPI's and exceeded them in 2022-2023. They are on track to exceed them again in 2023-2024 The number of job postings has increased by 66% in these last 2 years.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

			<p>The CS team constantly scans the undergraduate business school landscape and will continue to benchmark against our peers.</p>	
	8	<p>“RC should explore ways to encourage and facilitate pre-graduation professional experiences. These experiences may include internships during the school year or the summer, or they may be part-time employment in a professional setting. Career Services can help students identify these opportunities and present themselves as qualified candidates.”</p>	<p>Rotman Commerce and the Arts & Science Internship Program (ASIP) are exploring an ASIP offering for Rotman Commerce students.</p> <p>The existing structure of ASIP may require some customization for Rotman Commerce students. Different units across Rotman Commerce (e.g. Academic Services, Career Services, Centre for Professional Skills) will be engaged in a series of meetings in winter 2024.</p> <p>If the structure and details can be worked out, the timeline for Rotman Commerce students' participation is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposal through governance - Fall 2024 • First group of students enrolled in ASIP - fall 2025 • First work term for those students - summer 2026. <p>Beyond internships and a potential ASIP offering, Rotman Commerce offers several opportunities for students to develop skills and careers. For example, we have a strong relationship with CPA Ontario. They provide workshops and skill developing activities specific to professional accounting standards. National case competitions such as the NIBC Global Investment Banking Competition help students understand how to dissect a company's financials and pitch investments.</p>	<p>The Deans support the program's efforts to develop professional experiences. The A&S Office of Experiential Learning and Outreach Support (ELOS) is consulting with Rotman Commerce to explore the possibility of a Rotman Commerce focus within ASIP.</p>

			<p>Our career treks to New York, Bay Street and various office visits to insurance firms, technology companies, CPG/retail companies allow students to walk the halls of prospective employers and experience their cultures firsthand.</p> <p>New in Fall 2023, our Career Discovery Weeks program brought 100 employers to students over a 2-week period for them to explore career options, participate in hackathons and engage in panel discussions about various career options.</p>	
<p>The reviewers observed that the lack of cohesive, shared space impacts the sense of community in the program; they noted concerns regarding timelines for completion of new spaces, and strongly urged that interim solutions be investigated to provide space for students, faculty, and staff to congregate and collaborate.</p>	9	<p>“Prioritize efforts to foster students’ sense of community[...] At present, classrooms, staff offices, study rooms, and event space are in different locations... we strongly urge the university to provide additional space such as a dedicated events space and greater access to modern classrooms in the Rotman building.”</p>	<p>In Summer 2023, the Faculty of Arts & Science secured dedicated event space at Student Commons for Rotman Commerce until November 2026 (anticipated completion of Woodsworth renovation project).</p> <p>The Rotman School is currently reviewing its classroom utilization to determine whether additional classroom space can be made available to Rotman Commerce. They are committed to accommodating Rotman Commerce as much as possible, without compromising utilization needs of the graduate programs.</p> <p>The Rotman School will occupy space in the new Academic Wood Tower once completed, and they are very open to dedicating a 2nd classroom in their current building for Rotman Commerce at that time (current expected completion – summer 2026).</p>	<p>The Deans agree that the space at Student Commons has been instrumental in providing much-needed event space, contributing to their community building efforts. As noted, the RSM is working to accommodate more Rotman Commerce teaching within the Rotman building.</p>
	10	<p>“We strongly support the advocacy for a new RC building that will centralize the RC staff, especially those student facing staff that support the program, as well as, moving many of the RC classes into one location.”</p>	<p>Rotman Commerce is incredibly excited about the plans for the new Rotman Commerce building to house students, faculty and staff in one location, supporting</p>	<p>The Deans agree that the new Rotman Commerce building will be an excellent addition to the RC program.</p>

			<p>the academics and co-curricular activities of the program.</p> <p>The focus for the next couple of years will be on fundraising, design development, construction management engagement, construction drawings, city approvals, tender and permits, with an anticipated construction start in Spring 2027. The current construction completion is scheduled for 2030.</p> <p>Rotman Commerce will celebrate the 100th anniversary of its first graduating class, on June 6, 2024. A celebratory soiree will be held on the evening of May 28, 2024, bringing our students, faculty, alumni, friends (including all donors to Rotman Commerce), staff and community together. The evening will feature interactive and engaging “walks” down memory lane, allowing guests to explore the past and present of the Rotman Commerce program. During this event, we hope to get our community excited by the plans for the new Rotman Commerce building that is in development – the first dedicated home for our program.</p>	
11	<p>“... we understand that RC is close to securing existing campus space for a Student Commons in a ‘long lease’ arrangement in the short term. We were relieved to hear that the arrangement is in progress, and we emphasize the importance of it. A dedicated space allows for planning and responsiveness for the many needs of business students: hosting company visits, putting on student events, and giving student organizations a place to work.”</p>	<p>Rotman Commerce is very appreciative of the event space that the Faculty of Arts & Science has leased on their behalf, at Student Commons. Over 120 events took place in Fall 2023 in those spaces.</p>	<p>The Deans are pleased that the interim space leased at the Student Commons has provided valuable event space for the program.</p>	
12	<p>“Several faculty from RSM noted the lack of ability to teach their upper division classes in the manner they preferred due to the lack of classroom technology. The</p>	<p>Follow up consultation with faculty indicated that the classroom technology issues are present in the early years as well as upper years of the program. First year courses are</p>	<p>As part of A&S ongoing discussions and collaborations with Learning Space Management for all A&S undergraduate and graduate course programming, A&S will</p>	

		<p>lack of technology could be addressed independent of a new building.”</p>	<p>normally offered in classrooms all over campus. The quality of the classrooms varies considerably and affects the quality and consistency of the delivery of first year courses when the classroom has a junior teaching station.</p> <p>Upper year courses for Rotman Commerce are mostly taught in the Woodsworth building where the program has priority access to the lower-level classrooms. For these classrooms, faculty noted a lack of the following items as having an impact on the quality of the course delivery:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dual screens and larger screens to allow instructor to showcase slides and excel simultaneously, • Podium screens that allow for interactive writing, • Recording capabilities for students to join class remotely (if they are unable to come in person for health reasons), • Podium computers that save instructor settings (currently, the Woodsworth computers are reset to default setting each day. For instructors needing excel add-ons, or other software, this requires them to install the software before each lecture). <p>Instructors assigned to classrooms in the Rotman building noted great satisfaction given the adequate technology. Having access to the TEAL (Technology Enhanced Active Learning) classrooms such as 4-422 in OISE was also noted as positive contributor to</p>	<p>continue to work to support classroom renovations and technology upgrades.</p> <p>RSM will further coordinate with the program to provide more teaching space in the Rotman building to support upper year courses especially those that require more advanced technologies.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

			<p>class delivery.</p> <p>In the short term, Rotman Commerce will continue to advocate for access to classrooms space in the Rotman building and will explore upgrading the technology in the Woodsworth classrooms to bring them closer to technology offered in the Rotman building.</p>	
<p>The reviewers made a number of recommendations related to the Certificate in Business Fundamentals including the topics covered, the structure of program requirements, and course prerequisites.</p>	13	<p>“The RSM might consider adding operations as an option and requiring students to take at least two among marketing, finance, and operations.”</p>	<p>The Certificate in Business Fundamentals aims to provide a foundational education to Faculty of Arts & Science students who may be interested in management and business.</p> <p>Given that the certificate is an add-on to student’s existing field of study, it is not possible to include individual courses of all subjects. This is why MGT 100 is designed to cover the basics and principles of the various business disciplines. In designing this certificate, it was established that students would benefit in spending more time on Accounting, Finance and Marketing to have a better grasp of management and business.</p> <p>The recommendation of allowing students to have electives including an Operations course sounds appealing, but Strategy and Organizational Behavior & Human Resource Management are equally important areas in addition to Operations.</p> <p>This recommendation would therefore suggest having 3 more electives on top of Finance and Marketing. This may not be operationally feasible for students to take on top of their degree requirements for their major or specialization.</p>	<p>The Dean of A&S recognizes the value of the Certificate in Business Fundamentals to A&S students. The A&S Vice-Deans Academic Planning and Undergraduate will be happy to work with the Vice Dean, Undergraduate and Specialized Programs at RSM on the possibility of any additional courses in this certificate in the future. However, given that this is a certificate program, rather than a major or minor, there are limits on the number of electives that can be provided as part of the program. The Deans agree to continue to offer the courses under the current design and can revisit the issue next time the program is reviewed.</p>

	14	<p>“We suggest that the accounting, finance, and marketing departments each decide whether MGT100 is necessary for the courses they teach in the Certificate program. If a department does not consider MGT100 necessary, then we recommend eliminating it as a prerequisite for that course.”</p>	<p>MGT100H1 is designed to provide students a foundational overview of business and management. Therefore, requiring students to take MGT100 before taking specialized subjects such as accounting, finance and marketing helps students think about these subjects in a broader context of business. This design also prevents students from thinking about these subjects in silos. Hence, while these three courses can be successfully completed without taking MGT 100, students may not have a complete picture of how the three courses should integrate with other aspects in business. The Rotman School does not plan to proceed with this recommendation,</p>	<p>The Deans support MGT100H1 remaining as part of the Business Certificate.</p>
<p>Other recommendations not prioritized in the Request for Administrative Response</p>	15	<p>“We encourage the program to use full population reporting to track success with [post-graduation employability] outcomes. In other words, report on the plans of all graduates. Of the 800 (say) graduates in a year, how many took full-time employment? How many went to graduate school? How many were looking for work at the time of the survey? How many did not respond at all? That would provide a more complete picture of an important outcome, and a better basis for continuous improvement in this important area.”</p>	<p>The annual employment report produced by Rotman Commerce states: “The employment rate is calculated on the percentage of students who have accepted job offers and are actively looking for work. Data is collected through a voluntary survey completed by the graduating class. Eighty percent of the 2022 graduating class completed the survey.”</p> <p>Unlike the FTMBA, there are no reporting standards for employment outcomes, however, Rotman Commerce does follow the process outlined by the MBA CSEA standards.</p> <p>For the next employment outcomes report (summer 2024) the program will explore how to track the students’ plans, as noted by the recommendation, and how to report it, so the data is meaningful and comparable year-over-year.</p>	<p>The Deans support the RC program leadership in this initiative.</p>

	16	<p>“Given how rapidly various aspects of business are changing, most (and perhaps all) business programs struggle to keep their curricula current. We would encourage RC to have a system in place such as peer review of courses to ensure that faculty keep their courses current.”</p>	<p>In the Fall of 2023, the Rotman Commerce Director began a review of the program learning outcomes (PLOs) and specialist learning outcomes (SLOs). This review included surveying Rotman Commerce employers from various industries and holding a focus group with faculty and a representative from the Rotman Commerce Student Association.</p> <p>The Rotman Commerce Director is currently working with a Curriculum Development Specialist from the office of the Vice Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education to incorporate the feedback received from the consultation and update the PLOs and SLOs.</p> <p>It is recognized that the current PLOs and SLOs need to be more actively promoted and communicated to faculty. The Rotman Commerce Director will work on a plan to address this once the updated PLOs and SLOs are complete. As a first step, the new course proposal form will be updated to include a reference to the PLOs and SLOs where instructors are asked to demonstrate how a new course will respond to a specific PLO or SLO. These are all immediate actions.</p> <p>The revised PLO’s/SLO’s will also reflect greater alignment with the CPS professional skills.</p> <p>In the medium term, the Rotman Commerce program will update the course outline template to clearly set the course learning outcomes to create accountability on the part of the instructors and the area coordinator.</p> <p>Professional skills outlined by CPS will also</p>	<p>The Deans are pleased to support the RC program leadership in its curriculum mapping project and will support its efforts to engage with A&S and RSM faculty teaching courses in the program to improve communication of program learning outcomes to students.</p>
--	----	---	---	--

			<p>become part of a course learning outcomes. This will ensure that we can properly plan the progression and coverage of professional skills over the 4-year degree.</p> <p>While allowing instructors academic freedom with regards to the delivery of the course, determining clear learning outcomes for each course will ensure consistency between sections of the same course. Area Coordinators will be asked to weigh in and approve changes to course learning outcomes. It is recognized that there is currently no formal oversight with regards to course learning outcomes for the various RSM courses in Rotman Commerce.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

3 Committee on Academic Policy & Programs (AP&P) Findings

The spokesperson for the reading group reported that the review summary had accurately reflected the full review and that the administrative response fully addressed the issues identified and no further questions or issues needed to be considered. The Reading Group commended the attention paid to the experience of first-year students in the administrative response.

No follow-up report was requested.

4 Institutional Executive Summary

The reviewers praised the Rotman Commerce program for its analytical rigor, and commented that the program's flexibility benefits students and allows for curricular innovation. They noted students' appreciation for both the applied nature of the program and faculty efforts to keep course material current and relevant, and applauded the strong TA support which allows instructors to provide effective feedback on student assignments. They were impressed with the work of the Centre for Professional Skills, supporting development of soft skills such as teamwork, communication, and ethical decision making, and praised the CPS' supportive partnerships with faculty to integrate these skills into students' coursework. They also commended the strong investment Rotman Commerce has made in student services staff, with departments focusing on academic advising, career services, and student life. Finally, they observed that the program's shared governance between the Rotman School of Management and the Faculty of Arts & Science supports an academic experience for students that is well integrated into the fabric of university academic life, and highlighted the atmosphere of mutual respect and cooperation among RSM and FAS faculty teaching in the program. The reviewers recommended that the following issues be addressed: reconsidering the current admission processes for the Rotman Commerce program in order to help alleviate substantial student stress, build community in the program, and enhance competitiveness among other undergraduate business programs; improving student satisfaction and building a sense of community within the program; exploring ways to increase students' opportunities to gain international experience; clarifying the mix of focus options offered through the Rotman Commerce programs; continuing to iterate on Career Services supports provided for students by exploring ways to encourage and facilitate pre-graduation professional experiences, investigating the types of career services offered by other similar programs, and identifying benchmarks to gain insights for enhancing post-graduation employment rates and starting salaries; investigating ways to address the lack of cohesive, shared space for RC program students, faculty, and staff to congregate and collaborate; and considering suggested updates to the Certificate in Business Fundamentals including the topics covered, the structure of program requirements, and course prerequisites. The Deans' Administrative Response describes the Faculties' responses to the reviewer recommendations, including an implementation plan for any changes necessary as a result.

5 Monitoring and Date of Next Review

The next UTQAP cyclical review of the Rotman Commerce Program and the undergraduate Certificate in Business Fundamentals will take place no later than the 2030-31 review cycle. The A&S Dean's office monitors progress on Implementation Plans through periodic meetings with unit leadership.

The Dean will provide an interim report to the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs midway between the 2022-23 UTQAP cyclical review and the year of the next site visit during the 2030-31 review cycle, to report on progress made on the Implementation Plan as outlined in the accompanying Review Recommendations Table.

6 Distribution

On June 30th 2024, the Final Assessment Report and Implementation Plan was posted to the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs website and the link provided by email to the Dean of the Faculty of Arts & Science, the Dean of the Joseph L. Rotman School of Management, the Secretaries of AP&P, Academic Board and Governing Council, and the Ontario Universities Council on Quality Assurance. The Dean provided the link to unit/program leadership.